

United States Patent and Trademark Office



UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

PPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO
10/714,447	11/17/2003	Edward Roberts	7567/80871	9363
22466 7	7590 02/16/2006		EXAMINER	
	ECA PHARMACEUTIC	BERNHARDT, EMILY B		
GLOBAL INT	ELLECTUAL PROPERTY RD PIKE	,	ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
WILMINGTON, DE 19850-5437			1624	

DATE MAILED: 02/16/2006

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

		Application No.	Applicant(s)				
Office Action Summary		•					
		10/714,447	ROBERTS ET AL.				
		Examiner	Art Unit				
		Emily Bernhardt	1624				
The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address Period for Reply							
WHICHE - Extensions after SIX (i - If NO perio - Failure to r Any reply r	TENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY VER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DAS 5 of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.13 (5) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication. In the form the mailing date of the third that the period within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, received by the Office later than three months after the mailing tent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).	TE OF THIS COMMUNICATION 16(a). In no event, however, may a reply be tim ill apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from cause the application to become ABANDONEI	l. ely filed the mailing date of this communication. O (35 U.S.C. § 133).				
Status							
1)⊠ Re:	sponsive to communication(s) filed on 30 No	ovember 2005.					
2a)⊠ Thi	This action is FINAL . 2b) This action is non-final.						
3) <u></u> Sin	Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is						
clos	closed in accordance with the practice under Ex parte Quayle, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.						
Disposition	of Claims						
4)⊠ Claim(s) <u>19</u> is/are pending in the application.							
4a) Of the above claim(s) is/are withdrawn from consideration.							
5) <u></u> Cla	im(s) is/are allowed.						
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	im(s) <u>19</u> is/are rejected.	·					
•	im(s) is/are objected to.						
8)∐ Cla	nim(s) are subject to restriction and/or	election requirement.					
Application	Papers						
9) The	specification is objected to by the Examine	r.					
10) The drawing(s) filed on is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.							
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).							
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).							
11)☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.							
Priority unde	er 35 U.S.C. § 119						
12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f). a) All b) Some * c) None of:							
1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.							
2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No							
3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage							
application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).							
* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.							
Attachment(s)							
1) Notice of I	References Cited (PTO-892)	4) Interview Summary	(PTO-413)				
2) Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) Paper No(s)/Mail Date							
3) Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08) Paper No(s)/Mail Date 5) Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152) 6) Other:							

Application/Control Number: 10/714,447

Art Unit: 1624

The text of those sections of Title 35, U.S. Code not included in this action can be found in a prior Office action.

Claim 19 remains rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Calderon and Bilsky references in view of Chang (WO'062 or US'908, applied as of its 102(e) date) for reasons set forth in the actions mailed 3/22/05, 7/5/05 and 9/9/05. Applicants' remarks in their most recent response characterizing Chang as a "teach-away" reference is also not persuasive. The fact that the methylated piperazines may be obvious to modify does not make the unmethylated piperazines nonobvious. The fact remains the secondary reference teaches both hydrogen and methyl can be present on piperazino carbons and thus Chang is very similar in structure to the subject matter claimed in the primary references. It is well settled that a reference is not limited to its preferred embodiments or working examples but for all that it fairly teaches. See In re Lamberti 192 USPQ 278; In re Mills 176 USPQ 196:In re Burckel 201 USPQ 67 regarding the latter point. However as stressed in a previous action the embodiments claimed herein are within the preferred embodiments taught by Chang. Additionally, applicants are in a poor position to argue for separate patentability of instant R¹ groups vs. allyl as well as H vs. Me on piperazino carbons as all have been originally presented as

Application/Control Number: 10/714,447

Art Unit: 1624

equivalents for purpose of practicing the invention. Note In re Skoll 187 USPQ 481 regarding the latter point.

Claim 19 remains rejected under the judicially created doctrine of obviousness-type double patenting as being unpatentable over claims of U.S.

Patent No. 6,696,447 for reasons set forth in the previous action. Applicants do not particularly traverse this rejection. A terminal disclaimer is needed to obviate it.

THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL. Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of this final action.

Application/Control Number: 10/714,447

Art Unit: 1624

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from

the examiner should be directed to Emily Bernhardt whose telephone number is

571-272-0664.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the acting

supervisor for AU 1624, James O. Wilson can be reached at 571-272-0661. The

fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is

assigned is (571) 273-8300.

Emily Bernhardt

Page 4

Primary Examiner

Art Unit 1624